# EXHIBIT 7

1	
2	
3	REALTIME AND INTERACTIVE REALTIME TRANSCRIPT ROUGH DRAFT DISCLAIMER
4	IMPORTANT NOTICE: AGREEMENT OF PARTIES
5	
6	We, the party working with realtime and rough draft transcripts, understand that if we choose to use the realtime rough
7	draft screen or the printout, that we are doing so with the understanding that the
8	rough draft is an noncertified copy.
9	We further agree not to share, give, copy, scan, fax or in any way distribute this
10	realtime rough draft in any form (written or computerized) to any party. However,
11	our own experts, cocounsel and staff may have limited internal use of same with the
12	understanding that we agree to destroy our realtime rough draft and/or any
13	computerized form, if any, and replace it with the final transcript upon its
14	completion.  Case: NAACP VS. ERCSD
15	Date: FEBRUARY 8, 2018 REPORTER'S NOTE:
16	Since this deposition has been realtimed and is in rough draft form, please be
17	aware that there may be a discrepancy regarding page and line number when
18	comparing the realtime screen, the rough draft, rough draft disk, and the final
19	transcript. Also please be aware that the realtime
20	screen and the noncertified rough draft transcript may contain untranslated steno,
21	reporter's note in double parentheses,

misspelled proper names, incorrect or

22 23 24 25	nonsensical English word combinations.  All such entries will be correct on the final, certified transcript.  Court Reporter's Name:THERESA TRAMONDO FIRM: VERITEXT LEGAL SOLUTIONS								
23		2							
1									
2	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK								
3	X NATIONAL ASSOCIATION FOR								
4	THE ADVANCEMENT OF COLORED PEOPLE,								
5	SPRING VALLEY BRANCH, et al.,								
6	Plaintiffs,								
7	vs. No. 7:17-cv-08943								
8	EAST RAMAPO CENTRAL								
9	SCHOOL DISTRICT, et al.,								
10	Defendants.								
11									
12	Month Date, 2018								
13	Time ^ a.m. ^ p.m.								
14									
15									
16	Deposition of WITNESS NAME, held								
17	at the offices of Firm, Address, City, Page 2								

- 18 State, pursuant to Replace, before Theresa
- 19 Tramondo, AOS, CLR, a Notary Public of the
- 20 State of New York.

21

22

- 23 Reported by:
- 24 THERESA TRAMONDO, AOS, CLR
- 25 JOB NO. ^ ^

3

1

- 2 APPEARANCE OF COUNSEL:
- 3 FOR PLAINTIFF:
- 4 [!FIRM1]
- 5 [!ADDRESS-A1]
- 6 [!CITY1], [!STATE1] [!ZIP1]
- 7 BY: [!ATTORNEY1]
- 8 [!E-MAIL1]
- 9 [!PHONE NUMBER1]
- 10 FOR ^ PLAINTIFF ^ DEFENDANT:
- 11 [!FIRM2]
- 12 [!ADDRESS-A2]
- 13 [!CITY2], [!STATE2] [!ZIP2]

BY: [!ATTORNEY2] 14 15 [!E-MAIL2] [!PHONE NUMBER2] 16 17 FOR ^ PLAINTIFF ^ DEFENDANT: 18 [!FIRM3] [!ADDRESS-A3] 19 [!CITY3], [!STATE3] [!ZIP3] 20 BY: [!ATTORNEY3] 21 [!E-MAIL3] 22 [!PHONE NUMBER3] 23 24

25

4

APPEARANCE OF COUNSEL (cont'd):

APPEARANCE OF COUNSEL (cont'd):

FOR ^ PLAINTIFF ^ DEFENDANT:

[!FIRM4]

[!ADDRESS-A4]

[!CITY4], [!STATE4] [!ZIP4]

BY: [!ATTORNEY4]

[!E-MAIL4]

10 11 FOR ^ PLAINTIFF ^ DEFENDANT: [!FIRM5] 12 13 [!ADDRESS-A5] [!CITY5], [!STATE5] [!ZIP5] 14 BY: [!ATTORNEY5] 15 [!E-MAIL5] 16 [!PHONE NUMBER5] 17 18 ALSO PRESENT: 19 NAME 20 NAME 21 22 23 24 25

5

1
2 STIPULATIONS
3
4
5 IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED,
Page 5

6	by and among counsel for the respective							
7	parties hereto, that the filing,							
8	sealing and certification of the within							
9	deposition shall be and the same are							
LØ	hereby waived;							
l1	IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED							
L2	that all objections, except as to form							
L3	of the question, shall be reserved to							
L4	the time of the trial;							
<b>L</b> 5	IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED							
<b>L</b> 6	that the within deposition may be signed							
L7	before any Notary Public with the same							
L8	force and effect as if signed and sworn to							
L9	before the Court.							
20								
21								
22								
23								

6

24

- 2 BY THE COURT REPORTER:
- Q. Please state your full name for
- 4 the record.
- 5 A. Jean Fields, F-I-E-L-D-S.
- 6 Q. What is your address?
- 7 A. Home, 3 Deer Run Road, Pomona,
- 8 New York 10970.
- 9 WITNESS NAME, called as a
- 10 witness, having been duly sworn by a
- 11 Notary Public, was examined and testified
- 12 as follows:
- 13 EXAMINATION BY
- 14 ^ HEADERS
- 15 MR. LEVINE:
- 16 Q. We are on the record. Good
- 17 afternoon. My name is Randall Levine. I'm
- 18 an attorney for the East Ramapo Central
- 19 School District.
- 20 Could you please state your full
- 21 name for the record.
- 22 A. Jean E Fields.
- 23 Q. Thank you, Ms. Fields.
- 24 Do you understand you're here
- 25 today to give testimony in a case calls

7

1 2 NAACP of Spring Valley versus the East 3 Ramapo Central School District? 4 Α. Yes. 5 Q. Yes? Um-hum. 6 Α. 7 Have you ever been deposed Q. 8 before? 9 Α. Yes I have. When were you deposed last? 10 Q. Several years ago I don't 11 Α. 12 remember the year. 13 Do you remember what that case Q. 14 was about? Yes, I do. 15 Α. 16 Q. What was that case about? A gentleman was suing the school 17 Α. district for discrimination against Muslim. 18 19 Q. And you gave a deposition in that case? 20

Page 8

21

Α.

Yes.

Q. Did you testify in court in that

23 case?

24 A. Yes.

Q. Since you have done this before

8

- 2 we will quickly go over the ground rules
- 3 because you already know them in a
- 4 deposition I'll ask you a series of
- 5 questions your job today is to answer each
- 6 question as fully and truthfully as you can
- 7 to the best of your recollection do you
- 8 understand?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. As you can see the conversation
- 11 we're going to have today is going to be
- 12 transcribed and to make life easier for the
- court reporter, thinks go much more smoothly
- if we don't speak over each other do you
- 15 understand?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. I see that you do so I'll ask a?
  Page 9

18 "QUESTION: To the extent I'm able when I am finished speaking, I 19 will wait for you to finish speaking 20 and things will read much better. Do 21 22 you understand? 23 Α. Yes. 24 Q. If you have any trouble 25 understanding any question I ask you please

9

2 ask percent to clarify or rephrase and I

- 3 will do so. Downs?
- 4 A. Yes.

- 5 Q. If you don't tell me that you
- 6 doesn't understand my question I will assume
- 7 that you have understood it though okay?
- 8 A. Okay.
- 9 Q. If you need to take a break at
- 10 any time during the deposition please just
- 11 ask okay?
- 12 A. Yes.
- Q. All I would ask if I have asked Page 10

- 14 you a question and it's still pending answer
- 15 the question, and then we will take the
- 16 break okay?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. You may at times here your
- 19 counsel object to one of my questions. If
- 20 that happens, that's not an instruction to
- 21 you not to answer the question. So if you
- 22 understand my question you should still
- 23 answer it, okay?
- 24 A. Yes.
- Q. And if your counsel is going to

10

1

- 2 instruct you not to answer he'll do so
- 3 expressly, right?
- 4 A. (Nodding.)
- 5 Q. So do you understand?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Because this is being
- 8 transcribed only verbal answers will appear
- 9 on the transcript, so if I ask you a

10 question I need you to answer with yes no

- some other verbal response head shakes nods,
- shoulder shrugs don't show up on paper okay?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Before we get going do you have
- any questions for me about how the
- 16 deposition will go?
- 17 A. No I don't.
- 18 Q. A come of preliminaries is there
- 19 any reason you could think of why you
- 20 wouldn't be able to give full and complete
- 21 testimony today?
- 22 A. No.
- Q. Are you in good health?
- 24 A. Reasonably.
- Q. Have you taken any medications

11

- 2 today that might affect your memory?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. Are you represented by counsel
- 5 today?

- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Is that your counsel sitting
- 8 right next to you?
- 9 A. Mr. Jason.
- 10 Q. Okay I think these are all the
- 11 preliminaries.
- 12 I would like to mark for
- identification purposes Fields Exhibit 1
- 14 which the court reporter will hand to you
- 15 momentarily.
- 16 (Fields Exhibit # , description,
- 17 marked for identification, as of this
- 18 date.)
- 19 Q. The document that has been
- 20 placed in front of you, just now and marked
- 21 as Fields Exhibit 1 has a title called the
- 22 declaration of Jean E Fields do you see
- 23 that?
- 24 A. Yes, I do.
- Q. If you would turn to the final

- page of the document page 13 and I am going
- 3 to ask you to look at the signature close to
- 4 the middle of the page, is that your
- 5 signature?
- 6 A. Yes, it is.
- 7 Q. Do you recall signing this
- 8 document on December 1, 2017?
- 9 A. Yes, I do.
- 10 Q. Have you seen this document
- 11 before?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. Did you write the declaration of
- 14 Jean E Fields?
- 15 A. I dictated it.
- 16 Q. Without telling me anything that
- 17 you may have discussed or told your lawyers,
- 18 to whom did you dictate your declaration?
- 19 A. Attorney Jason.
- Q. Did anybody help you with the
- 21 dictation of your declaration?
- 22 A. No.
- Q. Are all the words in here to the
- 24 best of your knowledge your own?
- 25 A. Can I read it first?

13

1 2 Q. Sure. 3 Α. Yes. 4 Q. Thank you. You used to be an employee of 5 the East Ramapo Central School District; is 6 7 that right? 8 Α. Yes. 9 Q. How long did you work for East 10 Ramapo? 19 years. 11 Α. And how long have you resided in 12 Q. 13 the East Ramapo Central School District? 14 Α. Approximately 27, 28 years. Did you retire from the East 15 Q. 16 Ramapo Central School District? Α. Yes, I did. 17 18 Was that in 2013 that you Q. 19 retired? 20 Α. Yes. What have you been doing since 21 Q. Page 15

- 22 you retired in 2013?
- 23 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 24 A. Volunteering here and there.
- Q. Assuming you have been doing

14

1

- 2 something since you retired what have you
- 3 been doing since 2013?
- 4 A. I serve on a few boards, I
- 5 travel, I help with my grandchildren.
- 6 That's pretty much it.
- 7 Q. What boards do you serve on?
- 8 A. Salvation army, R S V P.
- 9 Q. What is that?
- 10 A. Retired seniors volunteer
- 11 program.
- 12 Q. Anything else?
- 13 A. JAMCCAR. It's Jamaican American
- 14 civic association.
- Q. Anything else?
- 16 A. The NAACP the executive board.
- 17 Q. What is your role on the

18 executive board of the NAACP?

- 19 A. I'm the cochair of the education
- 20 committee.
- Q. How long have you served in that
- 22 capacity?
- 23 A. A few years. I don't remember
- 24 when I started.
- Q. Would you say you served more

15

1

- 2 than two years?
- A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Nor than five years?
- 5 A. I don't know if it's that long.
- 6 I couldn't give you a date.
- 7 Q. Somewhere around five years?
- 8 A. Probably less than five years.
- 9 Q. Like four years?
- 10 A. I can't give you a date. I
- don't remember.
- 12 Q. I'm just trying to get a sense.
- 13 Did you serve in any other

- 14 capacity for the NAACP before you served on
- 15 the executive board?
- 16 A. No. I was just a member.
- 17 Q. How long were you a member?
- 18 A. About approximately seven years.
- 19 Q. Were you involved in the NAACP's
- 20 activities as a member?
- 21 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 22 A. Somewhat.
- Q. Like what? What did you do as a
- 24 member?
- 25 A. Went to meetings.

16

1

- Q. Did you work on any particular
- 3 projects?
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. What sort of meetings did you
- 6 attend?
- 7 A. Monthly meetings.
- 8 Q. Are you involved in politics in
- 9 the East Ramapo central school district in

10 any way?

- 11 A. Could you rephrase that?
- 12 Q. Sure. Why don't we come back to
- it actually.
- 14 Let direct your attention to
- paragraph 26 of your declaration which is on
- 16 page 8.
- 17 A. Um-hum.
- 18 Q. The first sentence of paragraph
- 19 26 I'll read so everybody could follow along
- 20 says from 2003 to 2013 I was a regular
- 21 attendee at board meetings does that mean
- 22 you were a regular attendee of East Ramapo
- 23 school board meetings?
- 24 A. Yes.
- Q. Why were you a regular attendees

17

- of board meetings at in that time?
- 3 A. I was a parent in the dis direct
- 4 I was an employee in the district I was a
- 5 community member.

- 6 Q. For those reasons you just
- 7 listed you were interested in the activities
- 8 at school board meetings; is that fair?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Did you vote in school board
- 11 elections during the same time period from
- 12 2003 to 2013?
- 13 A. Yes, I did.
- 14 Q. Did you work for any candidates
- 15 for school board during that time period on
- 16 their campaign, I mean?
- 17 A. No I supported candidates, but I
- 18 wasn't on the campaign.
- 19 Q. The second sentence of paragraph
- 20 26, you say during that time I witnessed a
- 21 shift in the tenor of these board meetings
- 22 as the board became hostile and unwelcoming
- 23 to members of the public school community
- 24 who attended do you see that?
- 25 A. Yes.

- Q. When you use the phrase public
- 3 school commune in paragraph 26 what do you
- 4 mean by that?
- 5 A. The parents of the public school
- 6 students.
- 7 Q. Is there anybody else besides
- 8 the parents of public school students who
- 9 would be members of the public school
- 10 community?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Who else would you say I'm only
- asking what you say who else would you say
- 14 counts as a member of the public school
- 15 community?
- 16 A. I think anyone who advocates for
- 17 public school education.
- 18 Q. It is not necessary to be the
- 19 parent of a public school students to be a
- 20 member of the public school community; is
- 21 that right?
- 22 A. That's true.
- Q. Is your understanding of the
- 24 public school community in any way limited
- 25 by a person's race?

19

- 2 A. No.
- 3 Q. So white people could be members
- 4 of the public school community?
- 5 A. Why of course.
- 6 Q. And Latino people could be
- 7 members of the public school community?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And black people could be member
- 10 of the public school community?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And Jewish people could be
- 13 members of the public school community?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Is there anybody who can't
- 16 absolute member of the public school
- 17 community?
- 18 A. I guess anybody who does not
- 19 advocate for public school.
- Q. What to you mean by advocate for
- 21 public school?

22 A. That is committed to strong

23 public school education.

Q. Is that like a -- is what you're

25 describing a policy preference in favor of

20

- 2 public school programs is that a fair way to
- 3 describe it?
- 4 A. I don't know.
- 5 Q. I'm just trying to understand
- 6 what mean by advocate for public schools.
- 7 So anybody who has a particular preference
- 8 for strong or well funded public school is
- 9 there a policy angle to it?
- 10 A. I don't know about a policy, but
- 11 anyone who believes and advocates for public
- 12 school education would that be community
- 13 even if though they don't have kids in
- 14 public school.
- Q. What specifically might somebody
- 16 who advocates for the public school in your
- 17 understand, what specifically might they be

18 advocating for?

- 19 A. Fabulous education, strong
- 20 programs, just the best that a kid could get
- 21 in the public school.
- Q. Would an advocate for public
- 23 schools advocate for better funding of
- 24 public school?
- MR. JASON: Objection.

21

- 2 A. I think it advocates for the
- 3 best education that a students could obtain
- 4 in a public school whatever that means I
- 5 mean whatever avenues.
- 6 Q. Turning back to paragraph 26,
- 7 you say that you witnessed a shift in the
- 8 tenor of these board meetings as the board
- 9 became hostile and unwelcoming to members of
- 10 the public school community to attended if
- 11 the board is hostile to the members of the
- 12 public school community what community is
- 13 the board from?

- 14 A. The majority private school
- 15 community.
- 16 Q. I'm just asking for your
- 17 understanding what do you mean when you say
- 18 private school community?
- 19 A. Any student in school that is
- 20 not attending public school of a school age.
- Q. That would be private school
- 22 students, right?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. Is the private school community
- 25 limited to private school students

22

- 2 themselves?
- A. I think just that the public
- 4 school community is limited to those persons
- 5 who advocate for public school I think it
- 6 would be the same for private school.
- 7 Q. So the private school community
- 8 in your understanding is made up of people
- 9 who advocate for private schools?

10 A. Private educations yes.

- 11 Q. What sort of things do people
- 12 advocate for private education advocate for
- 13 specifically?
- 14 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 15 A. Not sending their child to a
- 16 public school.
- 17 Q. Anything else?
- 18 A. Not that I know of.
- 19 Q. When you say that you witnessed
- in a shift of the tenor of these board
- 21 meetings when between 2003 and 2013 did you
- 22 witness that shift?
- 23 A. Particularly I would say around
- 24 2005, there was a public school trustee on
- 25 the board education who was a holocaust

23

- 2 survivor and she advocated strongly for
- 3 strong programs she just loved students
- 4 loved kids and she lost her seat on that
- 5 board.

- 6 Q. Do you remember her name?
- 7 A. Yes, I do.
- 8 Q. What was her name?
- 9 A. Georgeanne HYDE, H Y D E.
- 10 Q. You witnessed a shift in the
- tenor in 2005 with Ms. Hyde's departure from
- the board did anything else happen in 2005
- 13 that contributed to your sense that the
- 14 tenor had changed?
- 15 A. Not that I can recall.
- 16 Q. Do you recall who else was on
- 17 the school board at the time in 2005?
- 18 A. I don't recall all the names.
- 19 Q. Do you remember anything about
- the other school board members in 2005?
- 21 A. No, I don't.
- Q. The only thing that changed in
- 23 2005 was that Ms. Hyde left the board and
- 24 that caused a shift in the tenor of the
- 25 board to make them hostile to the members of

- 2 the public school community is that your
- 3 testimony?
- 4 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 5 A. I don't know. I don't know what
- 6 else happened. I don't remember what else
- 7 happened.
- 8 Q. But you remembered that the
- 9 tenor of the meetings changed and the board
- 10 became hostile and unwelcoming to members of
- the public school community?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. But you don't remember why that
- 14 happened or why you felt that way?
- 15 A. I believe that Ms. Hyde was
- 16 replaced by a member of the private school
- 17 community.
- Q. Do you remember who that was?
- 19 A. I don't.
- Q. In that context when you say
- 21 private school community do you mean someone
- 22 from the orthodox or Hasidic Jewish
- 23 communities?
- 24 A. Yes, I do.
- Q. How many people on the board in Page 28

25

1								
2	2005 were from the orthodox and Hasidic							
3	Jewish communities?							
4	MR. JASON: Objection.							
5	A. I don't remember.							
6	Q. Was it just the one who replaced							
7	Georgeanne Hyde that you recall?							
8	A. I don't remember.							
9	Q. Was the presents of the one							
10	orthodox or Hasidic Jewish board member that							
11	replaced Georgeanne Hyde the reason in there							
12	was a shift in tenor of the board meetings?							
13	A. I couldn't tell you that because							
14	I don't remember who was there before if I							
15	had a list I could, but I don't remember.							
16	Q. It's an exam knots a test I only							
17	want to know what you remember?							
18	A. Okay.							
19	Q. When you say the board became							
20	hostile and unwelcoming to members of the							
21	nublic school community, what do you mean by							

22 hostile and unwelcoming?

- 23 A. Prior to that in order to being
- 24 a public speaker at a board meeting one
- 25 would come in fill out a card hand it in and

26

- 2 they able to speak at the beginning of the
- 3 meeting. When the tenor changed the
- 4 visitors or the people at the board meeting
- 5 were relegated to speaking at the end of the
- 6 meeting. And at the end of the meeting
- 7 meant sometime executive sessions would last
- 8 for hours and hours.
- 9 Q. Did those changes you just
- 10 describe occur in 2005?
- 11 A. I don't remember when. I know
- there was a gradual change, but I don't
- 13 remember when it changed.
- 14 Q. Was there anything else besides
- 15 those two things you just described that you
- 16 think represented the board becoming hog
- 17 tile and unwelcoming to members of the

18 public school community?

- 19 A. I remember people at the board
- 20 asking questions of the board members and
- 21 never getting answers feeling sometimes or
- 22 maybe they needed to do some research so
- they would give it to us next time and they
- 24 never did. Their questions all went
- 25 unanswered.

27

- Q. During that same time period
- around 2005, did you ever ask questions of
- 4 the board of the education that went
- 5 unanswered?
- 6 A. No. I was an employee.
- 7 Q. Do you remember any specific
- 8 instance of someone else asking questions
- 9 that went unanswered?
- 10 A. No, but I do remember people
- 11 letting the board know that the questions
- 12 had been asked meetings or times before and
- 13 they never got an answer.

14 Q. Prior to 2003 did you attend any

- 15 board meetings?
- 16 A. Yes, I did.
- 17 Q. Do you know whether prior to
- 18 2003 there were public school advocates on
- 19 the board of education?
- 20 A. Could you repeat that?
- Q. Yes. I'm asking about prior to
- 22 2003. So in paragraph 26 you're talking
- 23 about 2003 to 2013?
- 24 A. Uh-hum.
- Q. Prior to 2003, were there public

28

- 2 school advocates on the board of education?
- 3 A. I believe.
- 4 Q. After 2003 were there public
- 5 school advocates on the board of education?
- 6 A. I believe so also.
- 7 Q. In 2003 do you know whether a
- 8 majority of the board of education were
- 9 public school advocates?

10 A. I don't remember. I know the

- 11 majority transition happened slowly, but I
- don't remember when.
- 13 Q. Same time period prior to 2003,
- 14 were there any African-American members of
- 15 the board of education?
- 16 MR. JASON: Objection.
- Q. If you know?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Do you recall the names of any
- 20 African-American members of the board of
- 21 education up to and including 2003?
- 22 A. Yes.
- Q. Who do you recall?
- 24 A. Jacqueline Anderson, Susan
- 25 Gordon, Dr. Daniel Bright, Wendell Watford

29

- 2 and I believe Susan Young Mercer. I don't
- 3 remember the years that she served though.
- 4 SPELL
- Q. After 2003, do you recall any Page 33

- 6 African-American members of the board of
- 7 education being elected?
- 8 So were any African-American
- 9 members of the board of education elected
- 10 after 2003?
- 11 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 12 A. I believe so. I don't remember
- 13 who they are, but I believe so.
- 14 Q. Do you recall any names?
- 15 A. I don't know who they are -- who
- 16 they were.
- 17 Q. To the best of your recollection
- 18 had there ever been a time in the last 25
- 19 years when there was a full nine member
- 20 board of education and there were no
- 21 African-American board members?
- 22 A. I don't recall.
- Q. So let me ask the inverse
- 24 proposition to the best of your recollection
- when the board has had a full nine member

_			• .	-				
2	board	has	ıt	always	had	at	least	one

- 3 African-American board member?
- 4 A. Last 25 years you said.
- 5 Q. Yes?
- 6 A. I don't remember.
- 7 Q. Best you can recall?
- 8 A. I don't remember.
- 9 Q. But you don't remember any times
- 10 specifically when there were no
- 11 African-American board members on the school
- board; is that fair?
- 13 A. No.
- 14 Q. I will ask it again. Sorry.
- 15 You done remember any time in
- 16 the last 25 years when there were no
- 17 African-American board members on the school
- 18 board, right?
- 19 A. Right.
- Q. Did something change in the
- 21 broader community in East Ramapo that led to
- the or was connected with the change that
- you observed on the school board?
- 24 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 25 MR. LEVINE: That's fair let me

31

1

- 2 ask it again.
- 3 Q. Did something change in the
- 4 broader up community of East Ramapo in
- connection with the change that you observed 5
- on the school board? 6
- 7 I believe that the that the
- 8 candidates that represented the public
- 9 sector were always unsuccessful in their
- bids for being a trustee. 10
- When you say public sector in 11 Q.
- 12 that context do you mean the public school
- 13 community?
- Α. 14 Yes.
- Did the demographics of East 15
- 16 Ramapo change in some way between 2003 and
- 17 2013?
- MR. JASON: Objection. 18
- Yes. 19 Α.
- How do you know that? 20 Q.
- We had an influx of students 21 Α.

- 22 right after the earthquake in Haiti.
- Q. So the demographic change that
- 24 you observed in East Ramapo, that involved
- 25 the decision of Haitian people to the East

32

1

- 2 Ramapo school district; is that right?
- 3 A. Haitian students and some Latino
- 4 students I think.
- 5 Q. Do you know whether the
- 6 population of orthodox and Hasidic Jews in
- 7 the East Ramapo school district also grew
- 8 between 2003 and 2013?
- 9 A. I don't know for sure, but I
- 10 would imagine.
- 11 Q. Why would you imagine that?
- MR. JASON: Objection.
- 13 Q. I'm just asking why you would do
- 14 so?
- 15 A. Populations grow there have been
- 16 lots of people moving into the county.
- 17 Q. Between 2003 and 2013 several

18 new members of the board of education were

- 19 elected from the orthodox and Hasidic
- 20 screw-ish community, right?
- 21 A. Say that again.
- 22 Q. Between 2003 and 2013 several
- 23 new members of the board of education were
- 24 elect and they were from the orthodox and
- 25 Hasidic Jewish communities, right?

33

1

- 2 A. Yes.
- Q. At some point between 2013 and
- 4 2013 people from the orthodox and Hasidic
- 5 Jewish community elected a majority of the
- 6 board members; is that right?
- 7 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. So at some point between 2003
- 10 and 2013 a majority of the members of the
- 11 board of education were people from the
- 12 orthodox and Hasidic Jewish community right?
- 13 MR. JASON: Objection.

14 A. Yes.

- 15 Q. Do you know when between 2003
- 16 and 2013 that occurred?
- 17 A. I couldn't be specific.
- 18 Q. Was it in 2005?
- 19 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 20 A. It may have started then, but I
- 21 couldn't tell you. I mean I simply don't
- 22 remember.
- Q. Were the board members from the
- 24 orthodox and Hasidic Jewish community
- 25 hostile and unwelcoming to members of the

34

- public school community who attended?
- 3 MR. JASON: Objection to form.
- 4 A. I believe we covered by not
- 5 answering questions.
- 6 Q. Now I'm just trying to ask
- 7 specifically about which board members. All
- 8 right. Before you said the board became
- 9 hostile. Now I'm wondering were the board

- 10 members who were from the orthodox and
- 11 Hasidic Jewish community hostile and
- 12 unwelcoming to the members of the public
- 13 school community?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Did you ever develop an
- 16 understanding in your own mind of why the
- 17 orthodox and Hasidic Jewish board members
- 18 were hostile and unwelcoming?
- 19 A. No I can't get in their heads.
- 20 I don't know.
- Q. Did you ever speak with any of
- 22 the orthodox and Hasidic Jewish board
- 23 members between 2003 and 2013?
- 24 A. Yes.
- Q. Who did you speak with?

35

- 2 A. Any member of the board that
- 3 visited my school I would have to escort
- 4 them around.
- Q. Did you tell them that in your

- 6 view they had become hostile and unwelcoming
- 7 to members of the public school community?
- 8 A. Absolutely not.
- 9 Q. Why not?
- 10 A. Because administrators were not
- 11 allowed to talk to board members. We had to
- 12 go through -- there was a protocol.
- Q. What do you mean by that?
- 14 A. While they were in our schools,
- 15 we could not go and talk to them. If you
- 16 met them outside and they said hi, could you
- 17 say hi to them. While they're in school you
- 18 could not.
- 19 Q. I understand what about outside
- 20 of school?
- 21 A. No.
- 22 Q. Why not?
- A. Because we don't live in the
- 24 same areas.
- Q. Turn to the same page bottom of

- the page, page 8 paragraph 28, so folks
- 3 could read along I'll read it, the board's
- 4 attentiveness and responsiveness to the
- 5 public school communities began to decline
- 6 around 2005 when candidates backed by
- 7 organizations and leaders favoring lower
- 8 taxes and maintaining a high level of
- 9 district services for private school
- 10 students gained a majority of seats on the
- 11 board. Do you see that paragraph?
- 12 A. Yes, I do.
- 13 Q. As you sit here today do you
- 14 believe that paragraph is accurate?
- 15 A. Yes, I do.
- 16 Q. When you say organizations and
- 17 leaders favoring lower taxes and maintaining
- 18 a high level of didn't services for private
- 19 school students, what organizations are you
- 20 referring to?
- 21 A. White organizations that lived
- in the Monsey, new square Kaser
- 23 neighborhoods.
- Q. Do you mean organizations from
- the orthodox and Hasidic Jewish communities?

37

1 2 Α. Yes. 3 MR. JASON: Objection. By organizations in the context 4 Q. of paragraph 28, are you referring to 5 organizations from the orthodox and Hasidic 6 7 Jewish communities? 8 Α. Yes. 9 Q. When you say leaders in the context of that paragraph, who do you mean? 10 11 Α. The same thing. 12 So by leaders in paragraph 28 do Q. you mean leaders from the orthodox and 13 Hasidic Jewish communities? 14 15 Α. Yes. 16 Q. How do you know if you know that those organizations and leaders favored 17 18 lower taxes? 19 MR. JASON: Objection. Because I've been to board 20 Α. meetings where they stood up and basically 21

22 said on behalf of their communities that

- 23 they wanted lower taxes.
- Q. Do you know whether they're
- 25 referring to property taxes?

38

- 2 A. I imagine so, yes.
- Q. How do you know the -- that they
- 4 favored maintaining a high level of district
- 5 services for private school students?
- 6 A. They also said that.
- 7 Q. Other than people from the
- 8 orthodox and Hasidic Jewish community
- 9 speaking at board meetings have you ever
- 10 heard anyone else from the orthodox and
- 11 Hasidic Jewish communities express that they
- 12 favor lower taxes?
- A. No, but I might add that the
- 14 person who spoke indicated that he spoke on
- 15 behalf of the organization. He belonged to
- 16 an organization.
- 17 Q. Do you recall the name of the Page 44

18 organization?

- 19 A. No I don't.
- Q. Did you ever form an
- 21 understanding of why the orthodox and
- 22 Hasidic Jewish communities favored lower
- 23 taxes?
- 24 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 25 A. No.

39

1

- 2 ^ CK fix communities.
- Q. Did you ever hear anyone say why
- 4 this particular organization from the
- 5 orthodox and Hasidic Jewish communities
- 6 favored lower taxes?
- 7 A. No.
- 8 Q. Do you have an understanding of
- 9 your own?
- 10 A. No.
- 11 Q. In the same paragraph when you
- 12 say maintaining a high level of district
- 13 services for private school students, what

14 specifically are you talking about there?

- 15 A. Whatever services the private
- schools get from the distribute.
- 17 Q. Such as?
- 18 A. Mandated services,
- 19 transportation and books that's all comes to
- 20 mind.
- Q. When you say mandated services
- 22 what services are mandated?
- 23 A. Mandated service is a term that
- 24 refers to special education students and any
- 25 service that they're required.

40

- Q. It's only for special education
- 3 students though?
- 4 A. Mandated services only applies
- 5 to special ed.
- 6 Q. In paragraph 28 you say that
- 7 candidates backed by organizations that
- 8 favor lower taxes and maintaining a high
- 9 level of district services for private

- 10 school students gained a majority of seats
- on the board. So by that, do you mean that
- in the 2005 election a majority of the board
- of education were members of the orthodox
- 14 and Hasidic Jewish community?
- 15 A. I don't know that. I don't
- 16 remember if it was 2005.
- 17 Q. But it was around 2005, right?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 20 Q. In your mind is there anything
- 21 wrong with members of the orthodox and
- 22 Hasidic Jewish community favoring lower
- 23 taxes?
- 24 A. Absolutely not. I'd like lower
- 25 tax as to.

41

- Q. In your mind is there anything
- 3 wrong with members of the orthodox and
- 4 Hasidic Jewish community favoring a high
- 5 level of district services for private

- 6 school students?
- 7 A. No.
- 8 O. Is there anything wrong with
- 9 members of the orthodox and Hasidic Jewish
- 10 communities running for seats on the school
- 11 board?
- 12 A. No.
- 13 Q. Turn to page 2 at the bottom of
- the page paragraph 8, I'm paraphrasing
- 15 correct me if I'm wrong, but paragraph 8
- 16 discussing budget cuts that affected the
- 17 school district beginning around 2009; is
- 18 that right?
- 19 A. ; is that correct.
- Q. Do you recall for how many
- 21 school years beginning in 2009 budget cuts
- 22 continued so let me take that in turns
- 23 actually to make it clear.
- 24 Were there cuts to the school
- 25 district budget in 2009 to your

- 2 recollection?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Do you remember whether there
- 5 were cuts to the school district budget in
- 6 2010?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Were there cuts to the school
- 9 district budget in 2010?
- 10 A. I think the cuts went on for a
- 11 few years.
- 12 Q. Do you remember whether there
- was cuts to the budget in 2011?
- 14 A. I don't remember.
- 15 Q. Do you remember whether there
- were cuts to the budget in 2012?
- 17 A. There were.
- Q. Do you remember whether there
- were any cuts to the budget in 2013?
- 20 A. That I don't remember either.
- 21 Q. In your role as a school
- 22 district employee at the time, did you ever
- 23 form an understanding of why there were cuts
- 24 to the budget?
- 25 MR. JASON: Objection.

1	
2	A. Would you please repeat that.
3	Q. Yes. I will ask the question
4	again.
5	Did you ever form an
6	understanding of why there were cuts to the
7	school district's budget
8	MR. JASON: Objection.
9	Q in that time?
10	MR. JASON: Sorry.
11	A. What I understood was that an
12	order came from the superintendent who got
13	her orders from the board that we needed to
14	slash certain areas. It was my job to make
15	sure that happened.
16	Q. So was your understanding that
17	the board of education directed the
18	superintendent to cut the budget?
19	A. Yes, because they're the only
20	ones with the authority to do that.
21	MR. LEVINE: I'm going to mark
	Page 50

22 for identification what we'll call

23 Fields Exhibit 2.

24 (Fields Exhibit # , description,

25 marked for identification, as of this

44

1

date.)

- Q. Please take a look at the
- 4 document that has been marked as Fields
- 5 Exhibit 2 which I will identify as a letter
- 6 to Dr. Joel Klein from the state education
- 7 department dated December 14, 2012, do you
- 8 see that?
- 9 A. Yes, I do.
- 10 Q. Take a minute to look it over
- and just look up at me and let me know when
- 12 you're ready to talk about it.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. In December of 2012, were you
- 15 still working for the East Ramapo Central
- 16 School District?
- 17 A. Yes.

18 Q. What was your position?

- 19 A. Principal.
- Q. You were a principal of the high
- 21 school, right?
- 22 A. Yes.
- Q. Have you ever seen this document
- that I have just showed you that is marked
- 25 as Exhibit 2?

45

- 2 A. No I haven't.
- Q. Did you read the document just
- 4 now?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Do you understand what it is?
- 7 A. Pretty much.
- 8 Q. What is your understanding of
- 9 what it says?
- 10 A. There is a deficit.
- 11 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 12 Q. Right.
- And you understand that it is a Page 52

- 14 direction from the commissioner of
- 15 education's office to the board of education
- 16 to take additional actions to reduce the
- 17 budget deficit?
- 18 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 19 A. Yes, I do.
- Q. Did you at any time form an
- 21 understanding of why the district had a
- 22 budget deficit?
- 23 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 24 A. Somewhat.
- Q. What was your understanding?

46

- 2 A. At one points there was a
- 3 discussion about too many or inordinate
- 4 amount of special education students going
- 5 to other schools where the district could
- 6 provide the services that they were going to
- 7 other schools for.
- 8 Q. How does that relate in your
- 9 mind to the budget deficit?

10 A. It costs money to send them

- 11 someplace else.
- Q. Do you know how much money?
- 13 A. I don't know. No.
- 14 Q. Do you know of anything else
- 15 that in your mind you associated with the
- 16 budget deficit?
- 17 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. Do you know whether the East
- 20 Ramapo Central School District is obligated
- 21 to provide education services to private
- 22 school students who live in the district?
- 23 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 24 A. Say that again.
- Q. Do you know whether the East

47

- 2 Ramapo Central School District provides
- 3 education services to private school
- 4 students who live in the district?
- 5 A. Yes.

- 6 Q. Do you know how many private
- 7 school students live in the school district?
- 8 A. I couldn't tell you a number.
- 9 Q. Have you ever known how many
- 10 private school students live in the school
- 11 district?
- 12 A. No I know it's a lot more than
- 13 public school students.
- 14 Q. Would you feel comfort
- 15 estimating?
- 16 A. Two to three times as many.
- 17 Q. Do you know whether the fact
- 18 that there are two to three times as many
- 19 private school students has an impact on the
- 20 district's budget?
- 21 A. Do I know why?
- Q. Do you know whether it does?
- 23 A. I'm sure it does.
- Q. Do you know why the fact that
- 25 the district private school students

- 2 outnumber the public school students affects
- 3 the district's budget?
- 4 MR. JASON: Object.
- 5 A. No I don't.
- 6 Q. Do you know -- how about this:
- 7 Do you know why -- no that's not the way
- 8 I'll ask it. Tell what you this is
- 9 difficult because it's uncomfortable. How
- 10 about this would you say that most of the
- 11 district's private school students are
- 12 children from the orthodox and Hasidic
- 13 Jewish computes?
- 14 A. I would say that most of the
- 15 district's private school students are white
- 16 students yes.
- Q. When you say -- you answered
- 18 white. I was asking whether most of the
- 19 private school students in East Ramapo are
- 20 from the orthodox and Hasidic Jewish
- 21 communities; is that, true?
- 22 A. Yes, and they're white right.
- Q. That is also true do you know
- 24 whether most of the private schools -- how
- 25 about this: Would you agree that most of

49

1 2 the private schools in East Ramapo are 3 orthodox and Hasidic Yeshivas? 4 Α. I would imagine so. 5 When I say Yeshiva do you know Q. what I mean by that? 6 7 Α. Yes. What is a Yeshiva? 8 Q. 9 A. A Jewish school. All right. Let me ask you a few 10 Q. questions about political career? 11 12 MR. JASON: Are we going to take 13 our break. MR. LEVINE: Do you want to take 14 last three minutes until we get to 3 15 16 o'clock. MR. JASON: I have that it's 17 past three. 18 MR. LEVINE: Let's take our 19 break now before we swift gears. 20 (Recess taken.) 21 Page 57

Q. Picking up somewhere around

23 where we left off, do you believe that the

24 budget deficits that started in 2009 were

25 the fault of the board of education?

50

- 2 A. I have no idea. I don't know.
- Q. Do you believe that if there had
- 4 been different people elected to the board
- 5 of education there would not have been
- 6 budget cuts from 2009 through 2012?
- 7 A. I don't know that either.
- 9 yourself, right?
- 10 A. I did.
- 11 Q. What year did you run for the
- 12 school board?
- 13 A. 2016.
- 14 Q. When you ran for the school
- 15 board in 2016, were you part of a slate of
- 16 candidates?
- 17 A. Yes. Yes.

18 Q. Did your slate have a campaign

- 19 platform?
- 20 A. Yes.
- Q. What was your platform?
- 22 A. Our slogan was education for
- 23 all.
- Q. Did your slate have official
- positions on education policy?

51

1

- 2 A. We believe in educating all
- 3 students.
- 4 Q. Did your slate have an official
- 5 position on the East Ramapo property tax
- 6 rate?
- 7 A. Not yet.
- 8 Q. What do you mean by not yet?
- 9 A. Well, we needed to -- we needed
- 10 to get a seat on the board in order to tell
- 11 what our views were.
- 12 Q. Why didn't you want to say what
- 13 your reviews were while you were

14 campaigning?

- 15 A. Because it wasn't always
- 16 feasible to get to see the things we needed
- 17 to see.
- 18 Q. Do you mean that you needed to
- be on the board to have enough information
- 20 to be able to take a position on the
- 21 property tax rate?
- 22 A. We actually -- yes, we needed to
- 23 get more information on property tax rate
- 24 what the school was submitting what the
- 25 school -- we needed a detailed -- what do

52

- 2 you call it.
- 3 Q. A budget?
- 4 A. A detailed budget, but more than
- 5 the detailed budget because there are
- 6 certain things that are in the budget. Not
- 7 serving a line item there are some things
- 8 that are hidden in there. We needed to see
- 9 all that.

10 Q. If you recall did any of your --

- did you have a campaign materials when you
- were running for the school board?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Did any of your campaign
- 15 materials reference property taxes in any
- 16 way?
- 17 A. I don't remember.
- 18 Q. Did your campaign slate have an
- official position on the school district's
- 20 bussing policy?
- 21 A. I don't remember. I know he
- 22 we've always had universal bussing.
- Q. What do you mean by universal
- 24 bussing?
- 25 A. Every child is entitled to ride

53

1

- 2 on the school bus.
- Q. What do you mean by always had
- 4 universal bussing?
- 5 A. As far as long as I could

- 6 remember there has been universal bussing.
- 7 Q. Did your campaign slate have a
- 8 position on whether the school district
- 9 should maintain universal bussing?
- 10 A. I don't remember that coming up.
- 11 Q. Did your campaign slate take any
- 12 official positions on any district services
- 13 affecting private school students?
- 14 A. You know we were concerned about
- 15 getting the best education for public school
- 16 students. And that's really what we
- 17 concentrated on. We wanted the public
- 18 schools to be as good as they could be. I'd
- 19 say as good as they were before. Like I
- 20 would say that every parent wants that.
- 21 Q. So services for private school
- 22 students were not a major part of your
- 23 campaign is that a fair statement?
- 24 A. That's a fair statement.
- Q. Did your campaign take any

- 2 official position on reducing district
- 3 services to private school students?
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. Did your campaign take any
- 6 official position on maintaining district
- 7 services to private school students?
- 8 A. No.
- 9 Q. Did you in your campaign make
- 10 any effort to appeal to the parents of
- private school students to vote for you?
- 12 A. There were private school
- parents who reached out to us.
- 14 Q. Do you remember specifically?
- 15 A. I don't know who they were. I
- 16 mean I don't remember their names. I know
- it was a group of women from the private
- school community who met us at the library
- 19 and their intent was that they wanted to
- 20 support us and they also wanted their
- 21 children to be educated.
- Q. In that context do you mean by
- 23 saying private school community the orthodox
- 24 and Hasidic Jewish communities?
- 25 A. Yes.

55

1

- Q. Did you meet with those women at
- 3 the library?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. Do you recall when about that
- 6 meeting may have occurred?
- 7 A. I don't recall. I don't recall,
- 8 but it has to be within the campaign year,
- 9 so.
- 10 Q. Do you recall who was there
- during that meeting?
- 12 A. Don't ask me names. I don't
- 13 know their names.
- Q. Who from your slate besides you
- if anyone was there?
- 16 A. All of them.
- 17 Q. So --
- 18 A. All of us were there.
- 19 Q. Did you bring anybody else with
- 20 you to the meeting?
- 21 A. I don't remember who else was

22 there.

- Q. Do you remember about how many
- 24 people were there?
- 25 A. I don't. 40-ish.

56

- 2 Q. Do you remember about how many
- 3 people there at least appeared to be from
- 4 the orthodox and Hasidic Jewish communities?
- 5 A. Majority.
- 6 Q. Do you remember what was
- 7 discussed in the meeting?
- 8 A. I believe I mentioned that
- 9 before, they wanted their kids to also be
- 10 educated and not just religious studies, but
- in secular education.
- 12 Q. What did you say in response to
- 13 them?
- 14 A. That we would look into it and
- 15 to as much as possible because all
- 16 children -- it's actually I think it's a
- 17 miss service to everyone when children are

18 not educated.

- 19 Q. Did you tell them that?
- 20 A. Yes they told us that.
- Q. Did they express any other of
- 22 their interests to you?
- A. No, they were mainly concerned
- 24 about their kids getting an education.
- Q. Did they offer to help your

57

- 2 campaign?
- 3 A. Yes, they did.
- 4 Q. What did they offer to do?
- 5 A. Speak to their neighbors,
- 6 distribute material. They attempted to do
- 7 set up a meeting which never came to
- 8 fruition.
- 9 Q. A meeting with who?
- 10 A. With other members of their
- 11 community.
- 12 Q. Do you know why that never
- 13 occurred?

14 A. I don't know.

- 15 Q. How did you meet the women who
- 16 set up this meeting?
- 17 A. It was just one woman and I
- don't remember. Someone must have reached
- out to her she reached out to someone and we
- 20 all got together.
- Q. Did you ever speak with her
- 22 again?
- 23 A. Yes I've since speak with her.
- Q. Do you remember her name?
- 25 A. I told you I don't.

58

- Q. Do you exchange e-mail website
- 3 her?
- 4 A. I've spoken to her by phone.
- 5 Q. Do you know whether the women
- 6 who were at this meeting in fact talked to
- 7 their neighbors and did the things they said
- 8 they would do to help your campaign?
- 9 A. I don't know.

10 Q. Can you any of any time when you

- 11 exchanged any form of written communication
- 12 with the women?
- 13 A. No.
- 14 Q. Text message?
- 15 A. No.
- 16 Q. Besides that meeting, did you do
- 17 anything else in particular to try to appeal
- 18 to voters from the orthodox and Hasidic
- 19 Jewish communities?
- 20 A. No.
- Q. It you campaign in any orthodox
- 22 and Hasidic Jewish neighborhoods?
- 23 A. Not exclusively.
- Q. Did you campaign in orthodox and
- 25 Hasidic Jewish neighborhoods at all?

59

1

- 2 A. Not exclusive I campaigned in
- 3 neighborhoods where there were some
- 4 orthodox.
- 5 Q. I understand what you mean?

- 6 A. Catch.
- 7 Q. What neighborhoods are those?
- 8 A. Spring Valley, Spring Valley
- 9 proper, Pomona, hill crest chestnut ridge
- 10 that's all I recall. Mostly Spring Valley.
- 11 Q. Were you well received in those
- 12 neighborhoods?
- 13 A. Yes.
- Q. When you referred to exclusively
- orthodox and Hasidic Jewish neighborhoods
- before, what neighborhoods were those?
- 17 A. Kaser, some of Monsey and new
- 18 square.
- 19 Q. You didn't campaign in those
- 20 neighborhoods?
- 21 A. No.
- 22 Q. Why not?
- 23 A. Because I didn't think I would
- 24 be welcome there.
- Q. Why didn't you think you would

		_	
<b>า</b>	L .	welcome	<b>-</b> la - a - a - 3
,	ne	WELCOME	There

- 3 A. Because when my husband and I
- 4 first moved to Rockland County we didn't
- 5 know the county and we drove into a street
- 6 in new square and we were surrounded by
- 7 bunch of men and we were escorted out.
- Q. Did the women you met with from
- 9 the orthodox and Hasidic Jewish communities
- 10 offer to campaign for you in those
- 11 exclusively orthodox and Hasidic Jewish
- 12 neighborhoods?
- 13 A. They said amongst their friends.
- 14 I don't know where their friends were.
- Q. So you don't know whether they
- 16 were offering to campaign in New Square,
- 17 Kaser?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. Do you have any -- form any
- 20 understanding of your own as to why the new
- 21 square community, for example, is
- 22 exclusively Hasidic orthodox Jews?
- 23 MR. JASON: Objection.
- A. No, I don't know.
- Q. You understand what I'm getting
  Page 70

61

1	
2	at? Do you know why or have any
3	understanding why Kaser, for example, why
4	the people there are exclusively orthodox
5	and Hasidic Jews?
6	MR. JASON: Objection.
7	A. I don't.
8	Q. Do you know whether orthodox and
9	Hasidic Jews exclusively send their children
10	to private schools?
11	MR. JASON: Objection.
12	A. Could you repeat that?
13	Q. Yes.
14	Before we had defined the
15	private school community in this context as
16	referring to orthodox and Hasidic Jews, and
17	so the question is, do you know whether
18	orthodox and Hasidic Jews send their
19	children to private schools exclusively?
20	A. I don't know.
21	Q. When you were campaigning for

the public school board did your campaign

- 23 have a get out to vote effort?
- A. Yes, we did.
- Q. What sort of things did you do

62

1

- 2 to get out to vote?
- 3 A. We went to radio stations we
- 4 visited many churches, we went to some
- 5 community gatherings people hosted and
- 6 mostly door to door knocking on doors.
- 7 Q. Did you do anything in
- 8 particular to try to help people get to the
- 9 policies on election day?
- 10 A. Yes, we did.
- 11 Q. What did you do?
- 12 A. We set up transportation.
- 13 People volunteered their times to drive
- 14 people to the polls.
- Q. Do you know about how many
- 16 people made use of that service?
- 17 A. How many people?

18 Q. Made use of that service?

- 19 A. I don't know. I was not
- 20 involved with that part.
- Q. Do you know whether any other
- 22 organizations offered similar services to
- 23 voters on election day?
- 24 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 25 A. I don't know.

63

1

- Q. Do you recall how many people
- 3 volunteered as part ever your effort to
- 4 drive people to the polls?
- 5 A. I couldn't tell you that.
- 6 Q. Before your run for the school
- 7 board had you ever been involved in politics
- 8 directly before?
- 9 A. As in running for office.
- 10 Q. Um-hum.
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. So you had never ran for office
- 13 before you ran for the school board in 2016?

14 A. That's correct.

- 15 Q. Did anyone on your slate have
- 16 any prior political experience?
- 17 A. Just one person.
- 18 Q. Who is that?
- 19 A. Sabrina Charles Pierre.
- 20 Q. If you recall what was
- 21 Ms. Charles Pierre's prior political
- 22 experience?
- 23 A. She was the end incumbent.
- Q. Did the NAACP of Spring Valley
- 25 support your campaign in 2016?

64

1

- 2 A. The NAACP does not take a
- 3 political stand on anything.
- 4 Q. Does that mean the NAACP Spring
- 5 Valley doesn't endorse candidates?
- 6 A. They'll vote for candidates, but
- 7 they won't go out and speak on their behalf.
- 8 Q. Does the NAACP of Spring Valley
- 9 have like a get out to vote effort of their

10 own?

- 11 A. They host a forum, but they
- don't say I vote for republican or democrat.
- 13 They just make candidates available so that
- 14 the public can see.
- 15 Q. Did NAACP of Spring Valley do
- 16 voter registration drives?
- 17 A. Yes, we do.
- 18 Q. For how long have the NAACP been
- 19 doing those kinds of voter registration
- 20 drives?
- 21 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 22 A. I don't know for how long. For
- as long as I've been a member I've been
- 24 involved in that.
- Q. How long has that been?

65

- 2 A. Seven, eight years.
- 3 Q. In your experience in the
- 4 community, would you say there is a high
- 5 degree of voter interest in school board

- 6 elections in East Ramapo black community?
- 7 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 8 A. No, there isn't. It's getting
- 9 better.
- 10 Q. Why do you think that is?
- 11 A. Because the efforts to get out
- 12 to vote and to register voters.
- Q. Why do you think there isn't a
- 14 high degree of interest now though?
- MR. JASON: Objection.
- 16 A. I don't know. I think when one
- 17 loses all the time one gets gun shy.
- 18 Q. So was there a period of time
- 19 when there was higher degree of interest in
- 20 school board elections in the black
- 21 community in East Ramapo?
- 22 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 23 A. I believe so, but I couldn't
- 24 tell you when.
- Q. Do you know or rather do you

- 2 have a sense for whether voter turnout from
- 3 black neighborhoods in East Ramapo is --
- 4 whether there is a higher voter turnout?
- 5 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 6 Q. Do you have a sense whether
- 7 there is higher voter turnout in black
- 8 neighbors in East Ramapo?
- 9 A. Black and Hispanic or just black
- 10 minority we will say minority.
- 11 Q. We will say minority?
- 12 A. There isn't, but I think every
- 13 year it gets a little higher.
- 14 Q. Can I ask it again so it's not
- 15 so jumbled.
- 16 In your experience is there a
- 17 high voter turnout from the minority
- 18 immunity in East Ramapo?
- 19 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 20 A. I'm not sure how is that
- 21 different from your last question.
- Q. It was the same as the last
- 23 question I just jumbled it before so for the
- 24 sake of the transcript I repeated it?
- 25 A. I'm going ask you to repeat it
  Page 77

67

1 2 one more time. 3 Q. In your experience do you 4 believe that there is a high degree of voter turnout from the minority community in East 5 Ramapo? 6 MR. JASON: Objection. 7 8 I believe it's getting higher Α. 9 every year. Do you believe it's been 10 Q. historically low? 11 12 Α. In the past, yes. Were you successful in your run 13 Q. for the school board? 14 No I was not. 15 Α. 16 Q. Do you think you lost the election because you're black? 17 No I think I lost the election 18 Α. 19 because someone else got more votes. Do you think that black 20 Q.

residents of East Ramapo have a fair

Page 78

22 opportunity to run for the school board?

- 23 A. No I don't believe that.
- 24 Q. Why not?
- 25 A. First of all I would like an

68

- 2 opportunity to -- to voice what my concerns
- 3 are and since there is always -- the
- 4 residents -- the minority residents never
- 5 have an opportunity to get in, on the school
- 6 board, so it's always the other side, the
- 7 other community, and something about that.
- Q. Well, let's drill down on that a
- 9 little bit.
- 10 Do the residents from the
- 11 minority community, are they not able to get
- 12 elected to the school board because they're
- 13 minorities?
- 14 MR. JASON: Objection.
- A. I don't think so. I think it's
- 16 because they don't have enough votes.
- Q. Why do you think they don't have Page 79

18 enough votes?

- 19 A. Because in the Jewish -- the
- 20 orthodox and Hasidic communities there is
- 21 something called a bloc vote and whatever
- their interests are the bloc vote always
- 23 wins.
- Q. Does the bloc vote that as you
- 25 describe it, do they vote for minority

69

1

- 2 candidates?
- 3 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 4 A. They vote for people who have
- 5 their interests at heart whether they're
- 6 minority or not.
- 7 Q. Your understanding is that the
- 8 orthodox and Hasidic Jewish communities vote
- 9 for candidates who align with their
- 10 interests regardless of their rates?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. In your experience in East
- 13 Ramapo, has there ever been a problem with

- 14 minority voters being kept away from the
- 15 polls?
- 16 A. Not that I know of.
- 17 Q. Do you know or rather in your
- 18 experience have you ever seen candidates for
- 19 the school board in East Ramapo ever you
- 20 know campaign on an issue specifically about
- 21 race?
- 22 A. I have not, but I would like to
- 23 take a break.
- 24 MR. LEVINE: That's fine.
- 25 (Recess taken.)

70

- Q. In 2016 you ran against opposing
- 3 slate, right?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. And that opposing slate included
- 6 gentleman by the name of Pierre Germain do
- 7 you remember that?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And also by a name by the name Page 81

10 of Bernard Charles do you remember that?

- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And also a third candidate by
- 13 the name Yehuda Weissmandl do you remember
- 14 that?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. You specifically ran against
- 17 Mr. Germain, right?
- 18 A. Yes, he.
- 19 Q. Do you know Mr. Germain?
- 20 A. I've seen him.
- Q. Have you ever spoken to him?
- 22 A. Hello how are you that kind of
- 23 thing not had a conversation with him.
- Q. Mr. Germain is a Haitian
- 25 gentleman?

71

- 2 A. Yes, he is of Haitian dissent.
- Q. Do you know anything about
- 4 Mr. Germain's policy or preferences for the
- 5 board of education?

- 6 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 7 MR. LEVINE: You're right.
- Q. Do you know anything about Mr.
- 9 Germain's campaign platform from 2016?
- 10 A. No, I don't.
- 11 Q. Do you know Mr. Charles?
- 12 A. Yes.
- Q. How do you know Mr. Charles?
- 14 A. He's a member of the board.
- 15 Q. Have you ever spoken with
- 16 Mr. Charles?
- 17 A. Briefly also.
- 18 Q. Anymore than pleasantries?
- 19 A. No.
- Q. Do you know anything about
- 21 Mr. Charles's campaign platform when he ran
- 22 in 2016?
- 23 A. No, I don't.
- Q. Do you know whether Mr. Charles
- 25 Mr. Germain and Mr. Weissmandl ran on an

- 2 official slate?
- 3 A. I don't know that.
- 4 Q. If you look at your declaration
- on page 11 paragraph 35, it says I was not
- 6 invited to any candidate forum in the
- 7 predominantly white communities of East
- 8 Ramapo including new square Kaser or Monsey
- 9 do you see that?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Do you know whether there were
- any candidate forums in those areas in 2016?
- 13 A. I do not know.
- 14 Q. So when you say that you were
- not invited, you don't know that there was
- 16 anything candidate forum to have been
- 17 invited to?
- 18 A. That's correct.
- 19 Q. In this context when you say
- 20 predominantly white communities of East
- 21 Ramapo because you're referring to new
- 22 square Kaser or Monsey am I correct in
- 23 assuming that you're referring to the
- 24 orthodox and Hasidic Jewish communities?
- 25 MR. JASON: Objection.

-	1	

- 2 Α. Yes.
- 3 Q. The second sentence of the same
- 4 paragraph says I was not invited to campaign
- in any of these predominantly white 5
- 6 neighborhoods villages or ham let's in East
- 7 Ramapo to do you see that?
- 8 Α. Yes.
- 9 Do you know whether anyone was Q.
- invited to campaign in those neighborhoods? 10
- Where the campaigns took place I 11 Α.
- 12 don't know.
- And the final sentence of the 13 Q.
- same paragraph you say that you did not 14
- campaign in those neighbors, right? 15
- 16 Α. Yes.
- 17 Q. Let's look at the next
- 18 paragraph, paragraph 36 where you say I do
- 19 not know which organizations or community
- leaders endorsed the slate on which my 20
- opponent ran do you see that? 21

22 A. Yes.

- Q. Do you know whether any
- 24 organization or community leader endorsed
- 25 the slate your opponent ran on?

74

1

- A. No, I don't.
- 3 Q. Second sentence you say I was
- 4 never offered an opportunity to compete for
- 5 a position on that slate or for the
- 6 endorsement of the community leaders who
- 7 endorsed my opponent do you see that?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Are you aware whether there was
- 10 a competition for a position on that slate
- 11 that you could have been offered?
- 12 MR. JASON: Objection.
- 13 Q. I didn't say that quite right,
- 14 but do you understand what I mean.
- You say you were never offered
- 16 an opportunity to compete for a position on
- 17 the slate do you know whether there was a

18 competition for a position on the slate?

- 19 A. The fact that there public
- 20 school employees running and people with the
- 21 interest of the private school, begs the
- 22 assumption that there competition.
- Q. What I mean is do you know
- 24 whether you know your over point Mr. Germain
- 25 had to compete with anybody to be on the

75

- 2 slate he was on?
- 3 A. He competed with me.
- 4 Q. For the election right? Did you
- 5 want to compete to be on the private school
- 6 community slate?
- 7 A. No.
- 8 Q. Do you know whether there was a
- 9 competition to be on the private school
- 10 community slate?
- 11 A. I'm not sure I get your
- 12 question. I'm understanding it differently.
- Q. I'm having trouble communicating
  Page 87

14 it I guess.

- The idea you say you were never
- offered an opportunity to compete for the
- 17 position on the slate on which your opponent
- 18 ran, do you see that?
- 19 A. Yes.
- Q. That assumes there was a?
- 21 A. Private school slate.
- Q. Right. And that there was some
- 23 opportunity that you could have been
- 24 offered, but weren't, right?
- 25 A. I think that if you lived in

76

- 2 Rockland you would know that there are
- 3 public school candidates and private school
- 4 candidates that's it.
- 5 Q. Why would you offered an
- 6 opportunity to run on the private school
- 7 slate?
- 8 A. To let them know what my
- 9 thoughts were.

10 Q. Weren't you already on the

- public school slate also?
- 12 A. Yes, I was.
- Q. So if you're on the public
- school slate why would you be an opportunity
- 15 to run on the private school slate?
- 16 A. Because the public school slate
- 17 I would imagine not. I would imagine I know
- is competing against the private school
- 19 slate.
- Q. Right. For the election?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. That's what their campaign is
- 23 about. I mean before that, the slating
- 24 process. When you got together with your
- 25 slate for the public school community

77

- presumably the private school got
- 3 together --
- 4 A. Exactly.
- Q. With their slate. I just don't Page 89

- 6 understand why you would be offered a
- 7 position, offered a chance to compete on the
- 8 private school slate if you're already on
- 9 the public school slate?
- 10 A. Because they are opposed to each
- 11 other. One opposes the other.
- 12 Q. So you run against each other in
- 13 the election?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Maybe I'm misunderstanding the
- 16 declaration. It sounds to me as you are
- saying you were never offered an opportunity
- 18 to be on both slates?
- 19 A. No. I don't think that's what
- 20 I'm saying.
- Q. So that's not what you're
- 22 saying.
- 23 What are you saying in the
- 24 second sentence of this paragraph?
- 25 A. I am -- I was not invited that's

- 2 the one or no.
- 3 Q. Second sentence of paragraph 36?
- 4 A. I was never offered an
- 5 opportunity to compete for a position on
- 6 that slate or for the endorsement of the
- 7 community, so it's either or. When the
- 8 forums are being set up, everyone is
- 9 invited. The NAACP and JAMCCAR sets up a
- 10 candidate forum and they invite all the
- 11 candidates that are running. When they're
- 12 setting up a forum and I tone know that they
- 13 did, public -- no everyone was invited I
- 14 don't even know if there was a forum.
- 15 Q. Does the private school
- 16 community to your knowledge hold candidate
- forums?
- 18 A. I don't know. I would -- I
- 19 don't know.
- Q. Do you know anything about how
- 21 they go about selecting candidates?
- 22 A. I have no idea.
- Q. Do you know whether there is any
- 24 kind of formal process involved?
- 25 A. I don't know.

79

1

- 2 So when you say that you weren't Q.
- 3 offered a tune to compete for the
- 4 endorsement of community leaders who
- 5 endorsed your opponent do you know whether
- any community leaders endorsed your 6
- 7 opponent?
- 8 I know he got more votes and he Α.
- 9 voted with the interests of the private
- schools. 10
- How do you know that? 11 Q.
- 12 Α. Because when the results come
- out you see it. 13
- How can you tell from the 14 Q.
- results that he votes from the private 15
- 16 school community?
- 17 Α. His votes came from private
- 18 schools.
- 19 Yes? Q.
- So it's set up in geographical 20 Α.
- district for each geographical district it 21

- tells you how many votes the person got in
- 23 that didn't.
- Q. So do you know whether any
- 25 community leaders endorsed Mr. Germain?

80

1

- 2 A. I don't know.
- Q. Do you know whether any
- 4 community leader from the private school
- 5 community, you know holds a competition for
- 6 their endorsement?
- 7 A. I don't think it's called a
- 8 competition.
- 9 Q. I'm just trying to understand
- 10 why you say that you were never offered an
- opportunity to compete for endorsements of
- 12 the community leader who endorsed your
- 13 opponent?
- 14 A. To compete for position on the
- 15 slate or for the endorsement.
- 16 Q. So you're saying you weren't
- offered an opportunity to compete for the

18 endorsements of the community leaders who

- 19 endorsed your opponent?
- 20 MR. JASON: Objection to form.
- 21 A. That's correct. I don't know
- 22 who they were.
- Q. Do you know that there were any?
- A. No, I don't know that either.
- 25 Q. So in the third sentence when

81

- you say I do not know what criteria those
- 3 organizations or leaders used to slate or
- 4 endorse their preferred candidates, do you
- 5 know whether there are any such criteria?
- 6 A. I don't know that, but there has
- 7 to be a way to choose someone to run there
- 8 has to be some formal process to choose
- 9 someone to run for office I'm just saying I
- 10 don't know what they did.
- 11 Q. Why do you say that, did you
- 12 need to do anything in particular to run for
- 13 the school board?

MR. JASON: Objection.

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. What did you need to do?

17 A. I had to go to a public forum

18 with maybe six or seven candidates who

19 propose, you know, candidates and we were

20 asked many questions from the public and

21 there was a body of people who were at the

22 end of the evening went back and processed

whatever and then determined which three

24 people should run for office.

Q. I'm asking something an a little

82

- 2 bit different. I understand there was a
- 3 process that you needed to go through to get
- 4 onto a certain slate, but just to run for
- 5 the school board, you don't need to be on a
- 6 slate do you?
- 7 A. You don't need to. You just
- 8 need to apply you need to have a certain
- 9 number of signatures and you need to make a

- 10 formal application to the board of
- 11 education.
- 12 Q. Right. So there is no reason
- why three people can't go down to the school
- 14 district and file those paper and run for
- 15 the school board?
- MR. JASON: Objection.
- 17 A. With the proper signatures.
- 18 Q. Right they don't need a formal
- 19 slate to do that?
- 20 MR. JASON: Objection.
- Q. Do they?
- 22 A. No I don't think so.
- Q. Right. So do you know whether
- 24 your opponent Pierre Germain Bernard Charles
- 25 and Yehuda Weissmandl went through any

83

- 2 formal slating process?
- A. No. They probably just got
- 4 together with the same interests and decided
- 5 to.

6 Q. Right possible.

7

- 8 MR. LEVINE: Off the record.
- 9 (Discussion off the record.)
- 10 Q. Two of your opponents in the
- 11 2016 election were black men, right?
- 12 A. One was.
- 13 Q. Mr. Charles was a black man,
- 14 right?
- 15 A. Wasn't my opponent.
- 16 Q. Two members of the opposing
- 17 slate were black men, right?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. And your understanding is that
- 20 they were supported by the orthodox and
- 21 Hasidic Jewish communities, right?
- 22 A. Yes.
- Q. Do you think that the race of
- 24 the candidates in your election was a
- 25 motivating factor for any of the voters who

2	voted?
3	A. No I have no further questions.
4	MS. MATTHEWS: I don't have any
5	questions.
6	MR. JASON: Off the record.
7	(Discussion off the record.)
8	MR. JASON: No questions from
9	plaintiffs.
10	(Time noted: ^ ^
11	^ a.m. ^ p.m.)
12	
13	WITNESS NAME
14	
15	Subscribed and sworn to before me
16	this day of, 201
17	
18	
19	Notary Public
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	